

COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF BULLEH SHAH'S POEM "APNA DAS THIKANA" THROUGH THE LENSE OF NIDA'S EQUIVALENCE MODEL

RAMLAH ZAFAR, Professor Dr. MUHAMMAD WASIF

1. MPhil Linguistics scholar, Superior University Lahore campus, Pakistan
2. Professor, Superior University Lahore campus, Pakistan

Abstract

This study is based on comparative analysis of Bulleh Shah's (A renowned Sufi poet) poem APNA DAS THIKANA focusing on two versions of translation by Toufiq Raffat and Kartar Singh Duggal. The purpose of the research is to find out the equivalence between the source text the target text, to highlight that either the both versions of translation convey the form and feel of the original text or not. For the analysis of these translations, researcher used the model of Eugene Nida's principle of equivalent effect as the framework. The main findings are both translators convey the meanings effectively but there is still gap between the source text and the target text. Overall Raffat's version of translation gives adherence of the culture of the Punjabi language providing contextually rich interpretation, on the other hand Duggal's translation is more focused on word for word translation and may compromise the cultural depth in Bulleh Shah's work.

Introduction

Bulleh Shah was an outstanding Punjabi Sufi poet who lived in the 18th century. His poetry displays issues of love, spirituality, mysticism, and social justice. His poetry is famous for its simplicity, intensity, and standard appeal, transcending spiritual and cultural barriers. Bulleh Shah's works keep to encourage readers with their profound messages of love, tolerance, and religious awakening. Bulleh Shah's status as a saint and Sufi is so widespread that it is said that no other Sufi has achieved the type of fame that Bulleh Shah has. In Bulleh Shah's poetry we find a very common conversation and everyday discussion that gives great and deeper thoughts about the philosophy of life, about the creator of this universe and His creations and Sufism. Dedication to worship, total dedication to Allah most high, disregard for the finery and ornament of the world, abstinence from the pleasure, wealth, and prestige sought by most men, and retiring from others to worship alone (Keller).

So regarding this very study it is based on a poetic translation of renowned Sufi poet Bulleh Shah and translations are done by two Indian and Pakistani famous writers Kartar Singh Duggal and Toufiq Raffat. Kartar Singh Duggal was born in Dhamal, Rawalpindi District and married to Ayesha Duggal. From the Forman Christian College in Lahore he got an M.A English degree. Duggal serve All India Radio in 1942 and become a station director and he produced programs in Punjabi and in some other languages, he also wrote many plays and eventually in 1966, he says good bye to AIR and become the Director of the National Book Trust of India. After that at the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting he also became an Information Advisor in 1973. He was nominated as the Fellow of the Punjabi University. During his writing career, Duggal has published ten novels, twenty-four short stories, seven plays, two poetry collections and seven works of literary criticism, and an autobiography. His works have been converted into foreign

languages as a translation. He regarded writing not just a profession or a hobby but 'meditation and penance' (Singh Rana, 2013).

Taufiq Raffat, a distinguished poet in Pakistan, is known for his unique poetic style that has influenced many other poets. Despite limited access to critical analyses of his work, studying his poetry can offer valuable insights. Critics like Zia Mohyeddin, Kaleem Omar, and Khalid Ahmed have all praised Rafat for his exceptional language use and control over expression, highlighting his impact on the poetic landscape.

Researcher selected Nida's principle of equivalent effect which has two aspects. As mentioned by Shakernia (2013) that Nida (1964-1980) proposed two types of equivalent effects, one is formal equivalence, which translates the source text into target texts as close as they could be without adding new words. The second equivalence effect is the dynamic equivalence effect, which allows the source text to be translated into the target text with its true essence and feeling and allows the translator to convey the same thoughts and ideas but does not use the same syntactic structure. Panou (2013) claimed that Nida was in favor to apply the dynamic equivalent effect on translation as Nida translated bible for multicultural and multilingual communities to give the same effect and feel as originally it was in the source text.

In translation poetry is considered a big problem because it not only gives a deep meaning, but also gives the structure of the language, culture, knowledge and language of thought, religious background and content. In addition, the poet's style, language and syntax preferences are also important. Poetry has been described as a "black box" (Francis 2006). A translator, especially a translator of drama or poetry, must understand the true meaning and significance of the original work in order to reproduce the meaning of the old work in the new work. Pritchard quoted Robert Frost as (1960, p. 476) "The figure a poem makes: it begins in delight and ends in wisdom". Researchers reach conclusions by analyzing data, understanding the text, and comparing it line by line with the target translation and its original ideas and thoughts that both translators haven't given the true essence of original text.

The Research questions of this study are:

1. To what extent are the translations of Toufiq Raffat and Kartar Singh Duggal equivalent?
2. To what extent Punjabi poetry can be translated in English by carrying its original meaning?

Research Objectives

To analyze the translations of Duggal and Raffat comparing the level of equivalence.

To find and explain either the poetic text can be translated in its true context and style or not.

Significance of the study

To explore the true essence of Bulleh Shah's poem "Apna Das Thikana," this research is significant for individuals who are closely connected to Punjabi culture, poetry lovers, scholars of South Asian literature, and enthusiasts of Sufi poetry. This research benefits Punjabi communities seeking a deeper understanding of their cultural heritage, literature students exploring the works of Bulleh Shah, and the researchers aiming to untangle the complexities of Sufi poetry within the broader context of Punjabi literature. Future researchers will get the benefits from this research by gaining insights into the interpretive methods employed in analyzing poetic works, understanding the cultural nuances embedded in Punjabi poetry, and build upon the findings to contribute in South Asian literature and Sufi studies. This research not

only enhances the understanding of Bulleh Shah's poetry but also paves the way for future generations to continue researching and interpreting Sufi texts.

Rationale of the study

This study examines Bulleh Shah's poem "Apna Das Thikana" by comparing the translations of Kartar Singh Duggal and Touffiq Raffat, using Nida's model of equivalence. This model, which focuses on dynamic equivalence, is essential for grasping the poem's spiritual and emotional layers. Although the poem is highly significant, no prior analysis has applied this framework, indicating a notable gap in the literature.

By investigating how each translator's choices influence interpretation, this study aims to deepen the appreciation of Bulleh Shah's work and contribute to the field of translation studies, paving the way for future research on Sufi poetry.

Literature Review:

However, the origins of translation can be traced back to human history. Over time, the phenomenon of translation has become the most important phenomenon of teaching. Nowadays, translation is considered a difficult phenomenon because there are many languages, each with its own rules, culture and historical beliefs. A good translation must control all these factors so that the translator can produce a good translation that is easy to understand, carries less meaning, and loses the thoughts, feelings and style of the old books. There is a translation in the area of grammar and lexicon. So, the translator makes some variations at the time of the translation of poetry from the source language to the target language (Yildirim, 2014)

Jacobson (1969) describes that there are three major types of translation, first one is intra-lingual which means to replace lexeme with the substitute or with the application of paraphrasing technique within the language. Second one is inter-lingual translation, which is complicated type, because of the large amount of semantic and pragmatic differences between source text and target text and the last one is inter-semiotics which is based on cultural and political transmission of first language into second language text. These three types of translation make the translation phenomena to the extent that a translator can easily select the type of translation which he wants as a field to work on it. Translation is the process to convert one language into another, it is easy to translate each word in prose and replace that word with the another word of the second language. But poetry is something different and difficult because it is not just a statement but it carries deep meanings in it.

A most famous American poet and translator Ezra Pound (1969) quoted by Venuti (2011) who has great experience in the field of poetic translation is of the view that the most part of a poetry translation is most of the time depends on the translator, in other words he has the responsibility on his shoulder of creating the new poem of the same level. Lefevere (1984) as quoted by Ketkar (2005) that, literature must not be considered as a simple discourse due to the fact it's far the consultant of the complete societal, cultural and political structures. while translating a literary text a translator need to keep all the above mentioned elements inside the thoughts to create an authentic translation. there are numerous theorists who provide the description approximately their theories of translation and in their theories they gift the standards and parameters of the

translation which a translator needs to follow while translating. Nida (1969) is a prominent figure in the field of translation studies and in this research work researcher has selected the Nida's framework of principle of equivalent effect of translation. Tan Zaixi divided the development of Nida's thoughts into three different main stages, namely, the early linguistic stage with obvious American structuralism, the middle stage of translation science theory and translation communicative theory, and the later stage of social semiotics (Zaixi, 1999).

Jabak, (2020) conducted a translation based research and applied Nida's three stages of translation theory (Communicative Translation, Dynamic Equivalence Translation which effect means target text must have the same feel and spirit as the source text provides to its audience, Functional Equivalence Translation) as a model on the translation of Soorah ash-shams in English language. And his results show that Nida's theory is not equivalent to translate the verses of Holy Quran with the original meanings feel and context. In the same way Al-Ghazalli (2012) also conducted a research on translation and drew findings that at the time of the translation procedure from original text to English, the translators had failed to get the verb phrase exactness due to the wide gap among the Arabic and English language structures. Abdelaal and Rashid (2016) have done research in translation to find out the grammatical loss while translating from Arabic to English and drew conclusion that there is a large number of grammatical and semantic loss being observed. Alshammari (2016) also conducted by the translations of the Az Zariyat surah, the study successfully employed Nida's model, revealing that the majority of adjustments were semantic in nature, aimed at clarifying meaning while maintaining fidelity to the original text. This highlights the complexities of translating sacred texts and demonstrates the model's effectiveness in addressing the challenges of form and meaning."

According to Nida (1969) while translating poetry the important thing is the effect which a work creates on its readers and listeners. Equivalent effect is likely the effect that creates the same as it is or nearly same effect on the readers as the target text creates on its readers. Panou (2013) said since (1960-1970) the equivalence in the process of translation has been the important element. In the translation of a text equivalence lays on the idea that is to provide the sameness to target translation as of source text. This equivalence impact includes the equivalence in different ways like sense, manner, meaning and effect on audience. Researcher selected two versions of translations of a poem written by a Punjabi Sufi poet Bulleh Shah and applied the Nida's principle of equivalent effect for the comparison of these two translations. In this research researcher has the aim to draw conclusion after making a comparison of two translators of the same poem and will find out that how much both translators are successful in creating the same effect meanings, aesthetic pleasure and feel on the target language readers.

Research Methodology

This study on Bulleh Shah's poem "Apna Das Thikana" involved selecting three individuals from Punjabi culture to provide their interpretations on the poem through interviews or surveys. Alongside, collecting these insights, a detailed examination of Bulleh Shah's broader body of work on spirituality was carried out to contextualize "Apna Das Thikana" within the broader context of his poetry. By synthesizing the participants' comments and interpretation and from the analysis of Bulleh Shah's writings, the study aimed to uncover the poem's deeper meaning within the culture and literary context of Punjabi heritage.

Data Analysis

In this comparison, the researcher found that how the two translations of Bulleh Shah's poem took on the importance of love in both the world and the spiritual. Through the language choice, cultural interpretations, and thematic nuances present in each translation, the researcher focuses on the different layers of meaning embedded in the poem.

By investigating the ways in which each interpreter expressed deep emotions and universal themes of love, the researcher reveals the unique emotions and nuances that each interpretation possesses.

Topic of the poem by Bulleh Shah

Title of the poem	TT 1 (Raffat)	TT 2 (Duggal)
لہنادس ٹھکانا	Where is your home?	Who are you?

This poem is a spiritual poem and has a deep meaning itself. The title of the poem conveys the sense of mortality of this world. If we take the Target text 1 from the above table, Raffat has not met the original sense of title. On the other hand, target text 2 translated by Duggal conveys the partial sense of title. The denotation is seeming different. Raffat's translation focuses on the physical location of one's home, indicating a sense of belonging or roots. On the other hand, Duggal's translation delves into a deeper existential question about one's identity and essence. Duggal has somehow done better with a little bit better sense and feel of the original like. Although, Toufiq Raffat is unable to understand what actually is said by Bulleh Shah. So, Duggal somehow shows dynamic equivalence with the original text. Actually the title shows that the Sufi poet Bulleh Shah wants to bring the attention of the people that what is your original destination. As he portrays a spiritual theme so in this context he gives the people this point that what is your destination. This means that through the accumulation of one's own efforts, the ultimate truth will emerge.

First Stanza

Original Text	TT 1 (Raffat)	TT 2 (Duggal)
لہنادس ٹھکانا؛ کدھروں آیا، کدھر جانا؟	Whence did you come? Where did you go?"	Where from have you come? Where do you go?

Both translations respect the original structure, but Duggal's use of "wherefrom" is more formal or less common in modern usage, while Raffat's "whence" retains an old-fashioned. Raffat's translation is more dynamically equivalent in terms of readability and naturalness for a modern audience, though "whence" is archaic. Duggal's use of "have you come" adds immediacy but "where from" reduces readability. According to Nida's model, Raffat's translation may lean more towards dynamic equivalence due to its clarity and accessibility, whereas Duggal's might be seen as slightly more formal but less dynamically equivalent due to the use of less common language. Both translations maintain a level of formal equivalence by preserving the original structure, but

Raffat's translation arguably achieves a better balance of formal and dynamic equivalence for contemporary readers.

Second Stanza

Original Text	TT 1 (Raffat)	TT 2 (Duggal)
جس ٹھانے دامن کریں توں اوہنے تیرے نال نہ جاتا	The place you pride in, will go for a song.	The office you are proud of is not going to go with you"

Kartar Singh Duggal translate on the basis of word for word and Raffat try to translate the deep meaning by using phrase "will go for a song". Raffat's interpretation maintains the essence of Bulleh Shah's line by capturing the idea that the place or thing one takes pride in will eventually lose its value or significance. The phrase "will go for a song" in Raffat's interpretation carries a metaphorical meaning. In this context, it suggests that something of value, something one takes pride in, will eventually lose its worth or significance and become easily attainable, as if it were being sold for a nominal price, like an item sold in a market for a song.

Duggal's interpretation is based on word for word translation. It emphasizes the notion that the objects or positions one takes pride in will not go along with them. The use of "office" adds a specific context, suggesting a professional or societal position that one may take pride in. This translation highlights the possessions and status.

Basically both translators translate it according to its meaning both have equivalence with text and give us the true meaning. Raffat use phrase and Duggal use the word office to give the context of the profession and authority in this world. The poet is saying that the things we take pride in might not stay important forever, reminding us that there are more meaningful things to focus on in life than just material stuff. So, here the poet is trying to awake the spiritual sense of the people to understand the bitter reality of this world on which he is feeling proud.

Third Stanza

Original Text	TT 1 (Raffat)	TT 2 (Duggal)
ظلم کریں تے لوک ستاویں کسب پھڑیو لٹ کھانا	kill rob the poor, think yourself strong	you are cruel, you harass people exploiting others is the way with you"

In the third stanza "ظلم کریں تے لوک ستاویں کسب پھڑیو لٹ کھانا" Duggal gives detailed description of the oppressive behavior, offering a deeper insight into the actions of the oppressor as compare to Raffat. Both translator's uses the sense for sense translation to convey the idea given by Bulleh shah. Both translations convey the central message of Bulleh Shah's poetry, which is the condemnation of oppression and exploitation. Raffat's translation maintains dynamic equivalence by adapting the original message into language and imagery that is culturally relevant to the target audience. Duggal's translation also exhibits dynamic equivalence by rephrasing the original line to convey the same message using language and expressions that resonate with the target

audience. Although it provides a more detailed description, it still captures the essence of the original text.

Both versions of translations adhere to Eugene Nida's Model of Translation Theory by achieving equivalent effect, dynamic equivalence, considering cultural context, and fulfilling the communicative function of the original text.

Forth Stanza

Original Text	TT 1 (Raffat)
کر لے چاوڑ چار دیہاڑے اوڑک توں اٹھ جانا،	Your four days' reign, will end before long; you will soon be put where you belong.

In these lines Raffat use literal translation and giving the idea that Bulleh Shah wants to give the readers. He focuses on the meaning and cultural context of Punjabi language. There is equivalence between the source and target language. On the other hand, Duggal didn't consider these lines separately and he didn't give the translation of these lines. By interpreting these lines within the context of his poetry, Raffat appreciate the deeper spiritual and social messages that Bulleh Shah conveyed. Translating these lines with a focus on dynamic equivalence helps to preserve the intended impact and cultural significance, making the message accessible to a contemporary audience.

Fifth Stanza

Original Text	TT 1 (Raffat)	TT 2 (Duggal)
شہر نموشاں دے چل ویئے جتنے ملک سامنا بھر بھر پور لنگھاوے ڈاہڑا ملک الموت مہانا	The Boatsman's ferry is full each time it crosses	your destination is the city of silence, where the god of death ferries not a few You may shout as much as you like

Duggal's translation directly conveys the idea of a "city of silence," which is a poetic way to refer to the afterlife or death. Duggal's translation does not cover the entire original text, resulting in a significant loss of content. The second line is missing entirely. The richness of the original text, including its repetition and cultural references, is lost. The evocative imagery of "ملک الموت مہانا" (realm of death) and the futility of shouting are not captured.

Raffat maintains the repetition found in the original, which emphasizes the inevitability of death and the futility of resistance. The translation preserves the haunting imagery and tone, particularly

the reference to the "god of death" ferrying souls. The translation's complexity confuses the readers or make the message less clear.

Last Stanza

Original Text	TT 1 (Raffat)	TT 2 (Duggal)
ایہناں سبھناں تھیں ہے بلہا او گنہگار پرانا	Bulleh, you old sinner, reckon your losses	But there alone you will fend your way, And Bulleh waiting for you

Raffat's translation maintains the reflective and humble tone, encouraging the target audience to think about their own actions. By directly addressing Bulleh Shah as an "old sinner," the translation preserves the personal and introspective effect. The phrase "reckon your losses" is adding a new layer of meaning that focuses on long-standing sin. It maintains the reflective and humble tone, directly addressing the subject and preserving the equivalent effect of self-awareness and introspection.

In Duggal's translation the personal and reflective tone is lost, as the translation does not directly address Bulleh Shah as an "old sinner." The focus shifts on waiting instead of focusing on original line and reflecting one's sins. It introduces a narrative style. It loses the direct, introspective, and humble tone of the original. This analysis shows that while Raffat's translation is closer to achieving the equivalent effect compared to Duggal's.

Findings and Conclusion

After analyzing the data, the researcher found that it is possible to translate Punjabi poetry into English according to the translation model explained by Nida. However, there are problems with language selection during translation. This is because in Punjabi, one word can evoke many meanings and thoughts as Punjabi is a richer and older language than English. In addition, the concept of Sufism includes many notions of thought and philosophy and cannot be defined only at the level of thought. Researcher finds that Toufiq Raffat's use more poetic language in his translation than Kartar Singh Duggal's. According to Nida's theory, analysis of the surface structure of the text not only creates a deep structure by helping the interpretation process, but also makes it possible to achieve balanced results. In this study, researcher has used Nida's theory of equivalent effect as a method of data analysis to make a comparison between the two versions of translation and finally concluded that Rafat achieved the equivalent effect in translation while Kartar Singh Duggal failed to achieve the same results. Even Duggal did not give the translation of all verses of the poem. Finally, the researcher concludes that both translators have their own strengths and weaknesses in understanding and interpreting the poem, but neither of them fully understands the poem, the depth and mysteries of Sufism.

References

- Al-Ghazalli, M. F. (2012). A Study of the English Translations of the Qur'anic Verb Phrase: The Derivatives of the Triliteral. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 2(3), 605.
- Jones, F. R. (2006). Unlocking the black box: Researching poetry translation processes. *Translation and Creativity: Perspectives on Creative Writing and Translation Studies*, London: Continuum, 59-74.

- Abdelaal, N. M., & M. D Rashid, S. (2016). Grammar-related semantic losses in the translation of the Holy Quran, with special reference to Surah Al A'araf (The Heights). *SAGE Open*, 6(3), 2158244016661750.
- Baxter, S. J. (2009). Journals in the Language Classroom. In *English Teaching Forum* (Vol. 47, No. 4, pp. 22-26). US Department of State. Bureau of Educational and Cultural Affairs, Office of English Language Programs, SA-5, 2200 C Street NW 4th Floor, Washington, DC 20037.
- Jabak, O. O. (2020). Application of Eugene Nida's theory of translation to the English translation of surah Ash-Shams. *TranscUlturAl: A Journal of Translation and Cultural Studies*, 12(2), 3-18.
- Ju Miao (2000) The limitations of 'equivalent effect', *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 8:3, 197-205, DOI: 10.1080/0907676X.2000.9961388
- Ketkar, S. (2005). Literary translation: Recent theoretical developments. *Translation Directory*301. [www. Translationdirectory. com/article301. htm] consulted on 29 April, 2021.
- Lefevere, A. (1984). That structure in the dialect of men interpreted. *Comparative Criticism*, 6(87), 100.
- Nida, E and C, Taber. (1969). *The Theory and Practice of Translation*. Leiden: E.J. Brill.
- Nida, E, A, (1964). *Toward a Science of Translation: With Special References to Principle and Procedures Involved in Bible Translating*. Leiden: E. J. Brill. 68.
- Nida, E. (1964). *Towards a Science of Translating*. Leiden: E.J. Brill
- Panou, D. (2013). Equivalence in translation theories: A critical evaluation. *Theory and Practice in Language Studies*, 3(1), 1.
- Pritchard, W. H. (1960). Diminished Nature. *The Massachusetts Review*, 1(3), 475-492.
- Roman Jakobson, (1969), *On the Linguistic Aspects of Translation*, in *Translation Studies Reader*, ed. by S. Gabrielyan, Yerevan: SahakPartev, 2007.
- https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Faiz-Ullah-10/publication/375004014_A_Comparative_Analysis_of_Heart_of_Darkness_and_Qalb-e-Zulmaat_A_Study_on_the_Application_of_Literal_Translation_Method/links/653dc9f40426ef6369e8a5e6/A-Comparative-Analysis-of-Heart-of-Darkness-and-Qalb-e-Zulmaat-A-Study-on-the-Application-of-Literal-Translation-Method.pdf
- Shakernia, S. (2013). Study of Nida's (formal and dynamic equivalence) and Newmark's (semantic and communicative translation) translating theories on two short stories. *Merit research journal of Education and Review*, 2(1), 001-007.
- Venuti, L. (2011). *World literature and translation studies* (pp. 202-215). Routledge.
- Linguistic imperialism in the globalized world: Examining English dominance and its sociolinguistic consequences
- https://scholar.google.com/citations?view_op=view_citation&hl=en&user=2s7182IAAAAJ&citation_for_view=2s7182IAAAAJ:9yKSN-GCB0IC
- Wang, D. (2017, February). Functionalist Translation Theory and Its Application in Literary Translation. In *2016 2nd International Conference on Education, Social Science, Management and Sports (ICESSMS 2016)* (pp. 330-334). Atlantis Press.